

Teaching Board of Ph.D. Course in Agricultural, Food and Forestry Sciences (SAAF) - Cycles XXXVIII-XXXIX

Minutes no. 8 - Meeting held on November 21st, 2023

Composition of the Academic Board:

			P	JA	A
1.	Abdelfattah	Ahmed			x
2.	Abenavoli	Maria Rosa	x		
3.	Agosteo	Giovanni		x	
4.	Barreca	Francesco	x		
5.	Bernardi	Bruno	x		
6.	Bombino	Giuseppe		x	
7.	Campolo	Orlando	x		
8.	De Luca	Anna Irene	x		
9.	Di Fazio	Salvatore	x		
10.	García-Ruíz	Roberto			x
11.	Giuffrè	Angelo Maria		x	
12.	Gulisano	Giovanni		x	
13.	Li Destri	Giulia	x		
14.	Lombardi	Fabio		x	
15.	Lucas-Borja	Manuel Esteban			x
16.	Lupini	Antonio	x		
17.	Marcianò	Claudio		x	
18.	Marziliano	Pasquale	x		
19.	Modica	Giuseppe		x	
20.	Monti	Michele	x		
21.	Muscolo	Adele Maria		x	
22.	Nicolosi	Agata	x		
23.	Palmeri	Vincenzo	x		
24.	Piscopo	Amalia Rosa Maria	x		
25.	Poiana	Marco	x		
26.	Porto	Paolo		x	
27.	Proto	Andrea Rosario	x		
28.	Schena	Leonardo	x		
29.	Sicari	Vincenzo			x
30.	Sorgonà	Agostino	x		
36.	Spampinato	Giovanni			x
31.	Strano	Alfio			x
32.	Sunseri	Francesco	x		
33.	Tassone	Valentina C.		x	
34.	Zema	Demetrio Antonio	x		
35.	Zimbalatti	Giuseppe		x	

The meeting takes place live in the “Francesco S. Nesci” room of the Department of Agriculture. The meeting will be chaired by the Coordinator, Prof. Leonardo Schena. The Vice Coordinator, Prof. Anna Irene De Luca acts as a verbalizing secretary. The special channel “Ph.D. SAAF (Cycles XXXVIII/IX)” created by the coordinator in the Microsoft Teams platform is activated to allow the participation of the members of the Board residing abroad (Dr. Abdelfattah, Prof. García-Ruíz, Dr. Lucas-Borja and Dr. Tassone). Dr. Tassone is considered to be absent with justification having previously sent an e-mail request to the Coordinator, while Dr. Abdelfattah, Prof. García-Ruíz and Dr. Lucas-Borja, who do not connect, are considered absent.

The Coordinator, noting that the Board has been duly convened by invitation sent by e-mail on November 16th, 2023 and that it is in a position to deliberate, declares the meeting open at 4:35 p.m. CEST. The agenda is as follows:

1. Communications;
2. Approval of minutes no. 7 of 19.10.2023;
3. AVA 3 System for Ph.D. courses;
4. Appointment of the Quality Assurance Ph.D Group;
5. Planning of the Ph.D. Educational Plan (XXXIX cycle);
6. Criteria for awarding ECTS credits for teaching and research activities (XXXIX Cycle);
7. Appointment Tutor;
8. Appointment of Co-tutor;
9. Authorization for the foreign period.

1. Communications

- The Coordinator reports that Dr. Maimona Munir, who was the winner of the competition for admission to the Ph.D. Course in "Agricultural, Food and Forestry Sciences" (XXXIX cycle) and admitted to attendance with D.R. no. 302/2023, did not provide for the acceptance's communication of the position with scholarship, as well as required by art. 5, par. 3, of the notice of competition. Consequently, following a scrolling of the ranking, with subsequent DR. no. 335/2023, the following doctoral students were admitted to attendance:

- i. CARIDI Roberta, MISALE Laura, PORCU Emanuele, and ZUMBO Antonio, scholarship holders under Ministerial Decree no. 118/2023;
- ii. PROCOPIO Giuseppina, scholarship holder under Ministerial Decree no. 117/2023, co-financed by CREA;
- iii. SBAGLIA Matteo, without scholarship.

The Coordinator informs that all Ph.D. students admitted to attend the course with DR. no. 335/2023 have regularly started their activities on November 2nd, 2023.

- The Coordinator emphasizes the importance of participation by Teachers to the Ph.D. boards and, if this is not possible, the timely sending of a motivated letter of justification. He also stresses the need to make specific reference to the Board for which the justification is requested.
- The Coordinator points out that, often, the requests to use the 10% budget available to each Ph.D student are not formulated with the necessary attention and underlines the need to scrupulously comply with the provisions of Art. 30, par. 9 of the University Ph.D. Regulations. In particular, he points out that "In order to benefit from it, the individual Ph.D. student must submit a request to the Tutor representing the need for the purpose of carrying out the research activity and quantifying the related expense. The Tutor, having evaluated this request, submits to the Coordinator an adequate declaration demonstrating the need for the activity and expenditure that must be strictly inherent to the specific program of the Ph.D. student's activity, requesting the relevant authorization".

The Board takes note of this.

2. Approval of minutes no. 7 of 19.10.2023

The Coordinator reminds those present that the draft of the minutes of meeting no. 7 of 19.10.2023 drawn up in Italian and English was sent on November 16th, 2023 to all members of the Board, together with the convocation for the today's meeting. The minutes, in both versions (Italian and English) were approved unanimously.

3. AVA 3 System for Ph.D.

The Coordinator reiterates that with the approval of the new Self-Assessment - Evaluation - Accreditation (AVA) system, called AVA 3 model, the Ph.D. Courses are also introduced into the Quality Assurance system (QA) and underlines that, together with the convocation of this Board, he has transmitted the following documents prepared by ANVUR:

- Guidelines for the Quality Assurance system in the Universities, approved by Resolution of the Board of Directors no. 26 of 13 February 2023;
- Model for periodic accreditation of Universities and courses of study with notes, approved by Resolution of the Board of Directors no. 26 of 13 February 2023;
- Questionnaire relating to the satisfaction of first- and second-year Ph.D students, approved by Resolution of the Board of Directors no. 64 of 21 March 2023;
- Questionnaire relating to the satisfaction of Ph.Ds, approved by Resolution of the Board of Directors no. 64 of 21 March 2023;
- Evaluation Form - Research Ph.D., approved by Resolution of the Board of Directors no. 221 of 3 November 2022.

The members of the Board present confirm that they have received and read this documentation.

As previously mentioned, the AVA 3 model therefore also introduces Ph.D. courses into the evaluation system, in line with Ministerial Decree no. 226/2021, which expressly provides for “a quality assurance system for the design and management of doctoral training in accordance with the Standards for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (EHEA), according to the indications of ANVUR”.

The Coordinator points out that the AVA 3 model, taking into account the provisions of Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021, provides for the QA of the Doctoral Courses for three **Points of Attention (PoA)** and, for each of them, a series of **Aspects to Consider (AtC)**, as follows:

PoA	Description PoA	N. AtC
D.Ph.D.1	Design of the Ph.D. Course	6
D.Ph.D.2	Planning and organization of training and research activities for the growth of Ph.D. students	7
D.Ph.D.3	Monitoring and improvement of activities	8

The Coordinator reads the **AtC**, emphasizing that they are detailed together with a series of explanatory notes in the document “*Model of periodic accreditation of university locations and courses of study with notes*”.

Subsequently, the Coordinator focuses on the role of Ph.D. Courses, as peripheral structures of the University’s internal QA, by reading what is reported in point “6.2 - *Ph.D. Courses*” of the Guidelines for the Quality Assurance system in the Universities approved by Resolution of the Board of Directors no. 26 of 13 February 2023.

The Coordinator reports that the questionnaires relating to the satisfaction of Ph.D. students and Ph.Ds. can be completed directly through the ESSE3 platform. At the invitation of the Coordinator, Prof. Palmeri informs that the structure in charge has provided for the insertion of the questionnaires on ESSE3 and that therefore doctoral students and Ph.Ds., each one as far as their competence is concerned, can access to fill them in; it remains to be defined, if the Board deems it appropriate, a time window for compilation which in this case must be communicated to Dr. Tortorella, head of the University’s area who will provide for this. Since this is still a newly activated platform, it is suggested, in any case, to verify whether the inclusion in ESS3 corresponds to the technical/operational possibility of compilation by students, since in this case this must be promptly communicated to the Dr. Tortorella.

This is followed by a long and articulated discussion at the end of which the Board, having acquired the information and documentation made available by the Coordinator, gives a mandate to the QA group of the Ph.D. (see point no. 4 on the today’s agenda) to deepen the different PoA and AtC in order to evaluate any points in which the Ph.D. is lacking and develop appropriate corrective actions.

The Board approves unanimously.

4. Appointment of the QA Ph.D. Group

The Coordinator points out that the appointment of a Ph.D. QA Group is fully part of the AVA 3 Ph.D. system and its establishment in all the Ph.D. courses of the University Mediterranea has been strongly encouraged by the Quality Presidium (PQA) and the Evaluation Unit (NdV). He reports that in the context of the Doctoral School, it was decided to propose to the Doctoral Boards active at the Mediterranean University QA groups consisting of 5 units including the Coordinator, 2 Professors of the Board, a Student representative and a unit

of technical-administrative staff. He brings to the attention of the Board that, after consulting the Director, he contacted and received the availability of Dr. Simone Santacaterina. In addition, he announces that he has received the availability of the vicar, Prof. Anna Irene De Luca, and also of the Prof. Agostino Sorgonà, highlighting that any other availability can be formulated directly by the members of the Board. Since there are no other availability, the Coordinator proposes that the QA group should consist of:

- Prof. Leonardo Schena (Ph.D. Coordinator);
- Prof. Anna Irene De Luca (Vice-Coordinator);
- Prof. Agostino Sorgonà (Member of the Academic Board);
- Dr. Edda Francomanno (Student Representative);
- Dr. Simone Santacaterina (Technical and Administrative Staff).

The Board approves unanimously.

5. Planning of the Ph.D. Educational Plan (XXXIX Cycle)

The Coordinator points out that according to the provisions of the University Regulations on Research Doctorates, the Teaching Board prepares a training plan of activities on the basis of which the doctoral student must acquire 180 credits over the three-year period and recalls that 4 hours of lectures at the Ph.D. are equivalent to 1 CFU, as per the resolution of the Council of the Doctoral School of 28.11.2022.

He also recalls that in the Ph.D. project, that led to the accreditation of the XXXIX cycle of the SAAF doctorate, the *"planned/expected teaching activity"* includes the following courses:

- Descriptive statistics and inferential statistics for the validation of experimental data in the agro-forestry field;
- Safety in research facilities;
- Evaluation of the sustainability of experiments and innovations for the validation of research paths;
- Use of the main databases and statistical sources in the agri-food and forestry sectors;
- Bibliographic research in the field of Agricultural, Food and Forestry Sciences;
- Presentation of experimental data and writing of scientific articles,

In addition to the *"planned/expected teaching activity"*, the Ph.D. project approved by ANVUR also includes *"other teaching activities"* including:

- Language improvement;
- Fundamental principles of ethics, gender equality and integrity;
- Exploitation and dissemination of results, intellectual property and open access to research data and products;
- Research and knowledge management of European and international research systems.

During the presentation of the projects, it was decided to provide for *"other educational activities"* common to all the Ph.D. courses of the University Mediterranea of Reggio Calabria, and, as such, organized at the School level. The Coordinator informs that the delivery of the Language Specialization Course for the doctoral students of the XXVIII cycle is scheduled from 4 December 2023 to 30 March 2024 and, therefore, the doctoral students of the XXXIX cycle, will be able to follow the courses together with those of the previous cycles.

The Coordinator reminds the Board that on 10.11.2023 he sent to all the Professors of the Department of Agriculture a communication with the subject *"Declaration of interest in holding courses/seminars as part of the teaching activities of the Doctorate in Agricultural, Food and Forestry Sciences (XXXIX cycle)"* (Prot. n. 0026570 of 10/11/2023) and informs the Board that it has received a total of 10 contributions, including proposals made by professors outside the Department. He points out that other courses/seminars not yet planned may be organized and made available to doctoral students both by the SAAF Doctorate and by the Doctoral School, also through the invitation of leading personalities in their fields of expertise at an international level.

Ultimately, taking into account the provisions of the University Regulations on Research Doctorates (Art. 5, paragraph 4, letter c) and, considering:

- The *"planned/expected teaching activity"* and the *"other didactic activities"* included in the Ph.D. project of the XXXIX cycle approved by ANVUR;
- Course proposals received in response to the Coordinator's communication (Prot. no. 0026570).

The following have been prepared:

- A proposal for an overall educational offer with an indication of the credits to be acquired with teaching/training activities and with research activities;
- A proposal of courses/seminars to be organized at SAAF Doctoral and Doctoral School level.

These proposals were sent on 16 November 2023 to all members of the Board, together with the convocation of the Board.

The members of the Board confirm that they have received and read the drafts.

The Coordinator projects and illustrates the proposed training offer. This was followed by an in-depth and detailed discussion, at the end of which the proposal was unanimously approved (Annex 1). The Coordinator projects and illustrates the proposal of courses to be organized at SAAF and School doctoral level. This was followed by an in-depth and detailed discussion, at the end of which the proposal was unanimously approved (Annex 2).

This item shall be read out and approved with immediate effect.

6. Criteria for awarding ECTS credits for teaching and research activities (XXXIX Cycle)

The Coordinator recalls that a proposal for "Criteria for the attribution of ECTS credits for teaching activities" was sent on 16 November 2023 to all members of the Board, together with the today's convocation. The members of the Board confirm that they have received and read this draft which, at the same time, is projected and illustrated by the Coordinator. This was followed by an articulated discussion during which the Board decided to make some changes to the distribution of the criteria for awarding ECTS credits for seminars/workshops and for participation in international and national conferences, while no changes were suggested regarding the criteria proposed for research activities. The amended document was adopted unanimously (Annex 3).

This item shall be read out and approved with immediate effect.

7. Appointment Tutor

The Coordinator informs the Board of Directors about a specific communication from the Vice-Rector for the University Projects and Research Infrastructures, Prof. Maria Teresa Russo, forwarded by e-mail by the Coordinator of the Doctoral School, Prof. Paolo Fuschi on 19.10.2023. In this communication, the Vice-Rector highlights the opportunity to verify that the tutors assigned to doctoral students holding PNRR scholarships are active members of research teams of the same projects and operate within the project actions consistent with the theme of the doctoral student's research program. The Coordinator reports that in a subsequent verbal interlocution, Vice-Rector Russo highlighted that in her opinion this condition would not be met for Dr. Lamia Rahali, Ph.D. student of the XXXVIII cycle, holder of a scholarship funded with the PNRR as part of the TECH4YOU Spoke 3 Goal 1 PP1 project.

The Coordinator informs the Board that Dr. Lamia Rahali, in meeting no. 3 of 02.03.2023, was assigned as a tutor Prof. Giuseppe Modica, full professor SSD AGR/10 at the University of Messina and member of this Teaching Board; this, in compliance with the current Regulations and on the basis of the consideration of the specific skills of the teacher regarding the thematic area in which the research to be carried out falls. In addition, Prof. Giuseppe Araniti, external to the College and associated with SSD ING-INF/03, was indicated as co-tutor, who - as an active member of the research team within the TECH4YOU Spoke 3 Goal 1 PP1 project - could have contributed to ensuring the consistency of the Ph.D. student's research program with the project actions planned and funded by the PNRR. Subsequently, Prof. Araniti, having reshaped the Goal 1 of the project, was no longer actively involved in PP1.

An extensive and articulated discussion followed, at the end of which the Board unanimously decided to confirm Prof. Modica as tutor of Dr. Lamia Rahali, since the conditions that had led to her appointment at the time had not ceased and in consideration of the need to protect the continuity of the Ph.D. student's research activities - as already started and planned - as well as to respect the consistency between the doctoral project and the specific skills required to the tutor. The Board as a whole, through the systematic verification and monitoring actions already put in place for all doctoral students, guarantees to verify the consistency between the research activities carried out by the Ph.D. student Lamia Rahali and the provisions of PP1 in TECH4YOU Spoke 3 Goal 1 project, with particular reference to the "*applications of precision agriculture aimed at agroecological intensification*". During the discussion, the availability of professors actively involved in the TECH4YOU Spoke 3 Goal 1 PP1 research team to act as co-tutors for Dr. Rahali also

emerged. Finally, the Board expresses its willingness to reconsider the issue following a specific and motivated formal request by the Deputy Rector Delegate for University Projects and Research Infrastructures, in which the references to the regulatory framework that may make a possible change of tutor necessary are more clearly explained.

The Coordinator highlights the need to appoint the Tutors of the doctoral students of the XXXIX Cycle, recalling that according to the provisions of the *University Regulations on Research Doctorates (Art. 5, paragraph 4, letter e)* the Academic Board “assigns to each doctoral student, within the first year of enrolment, a tutor chosen from among the members of the Board, with the function of supervisor and supervisor, who follows him in training and research activities, and annually evaluates his activity with appropriate forms of monitoring and verifies the attendance of the Course”. After a detailed discussion, in consideration of the projects presented by the candidates admitted to the doctorate and the availability that emerged, the Board assigns the following tutors to the doctoral students:

- Roberta CARIDI: tutor Prof. Agostino Sorgonà, Associate Professor SSD AGR/13;
- Laura MISALE: tutor Prof. Francesco Sunseri, Associate Professor SSD AGR/07;
- Emanuele PORCU: tutor Prof. Orlando Campolo, Researcher SSD AGR/11;
- Giuseppina PROCOPIO: tutor Prof. Leonardo Schena, Full Professor SSD AGR/12;
- Antonio ZUMBO: tutor Prof. Andrea Proto, Associate Professor SSD AGR/06;
- Matteo SBAGLIA (without scholarship): tutor Prof. Bernardi Bruno, Associate Professor SSD AGR/09;

The Board approves unanimously. This item shall be read out and approved with immediate effect.

8. Appointment of co-tutors

No requests were received.

9. Authorization for the foreign period

No requests were received.

As there were no other items for discussion and all the items on the agenda had been dealt with, the meeting was adjourned at 7.22 p.m CEST.

The Coordinator
Prof. Leonardo SCHENA

The Secretary
Prof. Anna Irene DE LUCA

ANNEX 1

TRAINING PLAN: Training/Didactic Activities and Research Activities (SAAF Ph.D. - XXXIX Cycle)

Training/didactic activities (CFU)

	Planned/expected Teaching Activity*	Other educational activities**	TOT
Year I	15	20	35
Year II		5	5
Year III		5	5
TOT	15	30	45

* Planned/expected teaching activity present in the accreditation proposal evaluated by ANVUR, organized by the SAAF Ph.D. (Mandatory)

** Other didactic activities included in the accreditation proposal evaluated by ANVUR, organized by the Doctoral School

** Other courses and/or seminars organized by the SAAF Doctorate and/or the Doctoral School

** Seminars/Workshops/Conferences related to the topics of the SAAF Doctorate, organized by recognized universities or research institutions

Research Activity (CFU)

Year I	23
Year II	56
Year III	56
TOT	135

Training/teaching activities + Research activities = 180 CFU

ANNEX 2

COURSES organized by the SAAF Doctorate/Doctoral School (SAAF Doctorate - XXXIX Cycle)

Planned Teaching Activity (Mandatory)

Course	Hours	CFU	Organization	Teacher
Descriptive statistics and inferential statistics for the validation of experimental data in the agro-forestry field	20	5	SAAF Ph.D.	Pasquale Marziliano Orlando Campolo
Safety in Research Facilities	10	2,5	SAAF Ph.D.	Simone Santacaterina
Assessment of the sustainability of trials and innovations for the validation of research pathways	10	2,5	SAAF Ph.D.	Giacomo Falcone
Use of the main databases and statistical sources in the agri-food and forestry sectors	10	2,5	SAAF Ph.D.	Nathalie Iofrida
Bibliographic research in the field of Agricultural, Food and Forestry Sciences	5	1,25	SAAF Ph.D.	Angelo Giuffrè
Presentation of experimental data and writing of scientific papers	5	1,25	SAAF Ph.D.	Antonino Malacrinò
Total	60	15		

Other teaching activities (chosen by the Ph.D. student)

Course	Hours	CFU	Organization	Teacher
Language improvement	40	10	Doctoral School	ihBRITISH SCHOOL of Reggio Calabria
Fundamental Principles of Ethics, Gender Equality and Integrity	4	1	Doctoral School	To be defined
Exploitation and dissemination of results, intellectual property and open access to research data and products	4	1	Doctoral School	To be defined
Research and knowledge management of European and international research systems	4	1	Doctoral School	To be defined
Principles and methods of instrumental analysis	10	2,5	SAAF Ph.D.	Agostino Sorgonà
Computational molecular genomics in agroforestry and environmental	10	2,5	SAAF Ph.D.	Antonio Mauceri
Ethnobotany: plants useful to man	20	5	SAAF Ph.D.	Carmelo Maria Musarella
R basics, modelling, and visualization	16	4	SAAF Ph.D.	Antonino Malacrinò
Habitat monitoring of EEC Directive 43/92	4	1	SAAF Ph.D.	Giovanni Spampinato
Aspects of environmental administrative law	12	3	SAAF Ph.D.	Giuseppina Lofaro
Innovative agronomic strategies to mitigate the negative effects of climate change on fruit crop cultivation	8	2	SAAF Ph.D.	Rocco Mafrica

The analytical project: development of innovative research and analytical methodologies in the agri-food sector	4	1	SAAF Ph.D.	Alessandra De Bruno
The use of Nature-Based Solutions for the control of erosion phenomena in mountain environments	2	0,5	SAAF Ph.D.	Giuseppe Bombino
Polyculture systems as promoters of ecosystem services.	12	3	SAAF Ph.D.	Michele Monti
The hydraulic arrangement of mountain basins with naturalistic techniques	8	2	SAAF Ph.D.	Pietro Denisi
Total	150	37.5		

ANNEX 3

Credit Criteria (SAAF XXXIX Cycle Doctorate)

1. Educational activities	CFU
CdL and CdLM Courses	Coerent with CdS
Courses organized by the SAAF Ph.D. (minimum 4 hours)	1 CFU/4 hours
Courses organized by the Doctoral School (minimum 4 hours)	1 CFU/4 hours
Seminars/Workshops	0.5 CFU
Participation in international conferences	1 CFU/day of the conference (max 2 CFU)
Participation in national conferences	0.5 CFU/day of the conference (max 1 CFU)

2. Research activities	CFU
Ph.D. Thesis	40
Scopus or ISI indexed article (first name and/or corresponding author)	25
Scopus or ISI indexed article (intermediate positions)	15
Scientific article: no Scopus or ISI (first name or corresponding author)	3
Scientific article: no Scopus or ISI (intermediate positions)	1
Paper accepted and presented at an international conference	10
Paper accepted and presented at a national conference	5
International conference poster (or ppt)	4
National conference poster (or ppt)	2
International Volume Chapter (first name or corresponding author)	5
International Volume Chapter (Intermediate Positions)	3
National Volume Chapter (first name or corresponding author)	3
National volume chapter (intermediate positions)	1
Research activities in foreign institutions (CFU/month or fraction of 1 week min)	10
Research activities at UNIRC laboratories (CFU/month or fraction min of 1 week)	3
Research activities in companies (CFU/month or fraction of 1 week min)	3